

IMPORTANT INFORMATION TO COMPLETE THE TABLE

Some parts of the table are locked and the user cannot change them.

All the comments should be entered into ONE table and put into ONE worksheet. This worksheet should be the first worksheet in the workbook in the case it consists of many worksheets.

User can add new rows, format cells, clear contents, sort the content of the table and uses other tools.

Just use a flat font without bold, strikethrough etc. It will be lost by processing the files and the meaning could get lost (e.g. strikethrough)

Do not use line breaks in cells.

Always enter a comment ID (mandatory).

Do not put a single comment or proposed change over several sheet rows even if it is very long.

All the comments must be in the first Excel sheet if there is more than one sheet.

Position Paper on the Implementing Rules for INSPIRE Services allowing Spatial Data Services to be invoked						
1	2	3	4	5	6	
Comment ID	Chapter, section or clause no./Subclause No./ Note 11	Paragraph/Figure/Table Note21	Type of comment Note31	Comment (justification for change)	Proposed change Note41	Proposed Resolution / Reaction by NS DT Drafting Team
DE1	all	all	G	we strongly recommend to first finalize the Technical Guidance in cooperation with IOC TF before setting anything into law (IR)	member states shall agree (IOC TF) on the final TG before setting the IR into law	This is a general comment that can hardly be tackled in the drafting team or drafting process. However the proposed change in the process (starting with technical details and then going for an abstract description in the IR) seems a bit unusual. Best to ask the INSPIRE consolidation team or the INSPIRE committee for advice. No changes in the paper.
DE2	all	all	T	how to publish invocable services types (their interfaces, their operations and parameters) to make them known in INSPIRE ? What are the generic aspects of this concept. There are many more architectural details needed, either in this document or in the INSPIRE architecture document.	please clarify	All INSPIRE Network Services are getting published via INSPIRE discovery services and using INSPIRE Metadata. Moreover the current Position Paper assumes than in case an SDS is discoverable via an INSPIRE discovery service and directly invocable via its Interface (for instance a WFS or WMS) we name this as 'non-mediated invocation' and the proposed (abstract) service operations of an INSPIRE invoke service could be fulfilled as described in the table on page 11/12. No changes in the paper.
DE3	2.1	figure 3	T	does the INSPIRE registry play a role here ? Is the specific invoke service interface registered somewhere?	add more architecture details: e.g. a register for service interfaces	An INSPIRE Registry does not exist in the legal INSPIRE frame and thus cannot be referred to on the IR-level but would clearly be a useful tool for the INSPIRE implementation and could be recommended in the technical guidance. A respective sentence is added.
DE4	all	all	G	the requirement to set up invoke service by member states is not clear. e.g. how many invoke services are expected from a member state ?	please clarify	As comment DE1 a general comment, where we do not know how to resolve the comment within the drafting of the IR. No changes in the paper.
SV1		figure 2	T	In figure 2 it seems that it is just spatial data services that are invocable. If invoke is a similar term as <i>execute</i> than all services (i.e. network services) should be invocable. Could an URL be an invoke service since it will execute e.g. a view service?		All Network Services are having well-defined & well-known (i.e. standardised) service interfaces (see the blue comment in the figure) and are supposed to be in any case invocable. Moreover the definition following on page 7 explicitly states that INSPIRE NS are 'per-se' invocable. The figure has been changed to also indicate that NS are invocable.

SV2	all		T	But we believe that invoke service is not just about executing any services. We understand the invoke service as an standardised interface (e.g OGC:WPS) in front of existing spatial data service (network services an other).	Agreed. No changes in the paper needed.
SV3	all		E	We still find it hard to clearly understand the definition of invoke service. To make it easier we suggest that a conceptual figure describing the three scenarios on page 8.	Beside the definition given in 2.2 on page 7. The description of the operations and the possible realisations in 2.3 should help to understand the definition. However the NS DT will try to also draft more figures. No changes in the paper yet, but more figures planned.
SV4			G	According to the Swedish INSPIRE law each of ~25 authorities are responsible for making data and services (data supplier) available within the INSPIRE concept. Will invoke service use/combine (invoke?) services from different service providers/authorities? It is important to clarify if invoke services will be a responsibility for each data supplier or if invoke service will be a common responsibility. It depend on the scope and definition of invoke service.	This is a general comment that can hardly be tackled in the drafting team or drafting process: The way a Member States decide and designs ist service settings is clearly not in the scope of the planned IR - however both scenarios could be possible. As a side note: The same argument holds for the way to realise any other NS for instance the view service or download service. No changes in the paper.
SV5	chap 2.2		E	In chapter 2.2, there should be a link to the survey, http://inspire.jrc.ec.europa.eu/documents/Network_Services/StatusfortheinvocationofINSPIRESDS-Finalv1.0.pdf . The report may affect chapter 2.2.1 and should be updated.	Agreed. The study has not been available, when th position paper had been drafted. Reference to the study is made.
SV6	chap 2.3		E/T	We had some difficulties in understanding chapter 2.3. Will the services be dynamically linked? Once again we would like to have a figure that explains the scenarios in chapter 2.1 with IN and OUT parameters. If service A and B are requested will the response from service A be used as parameter for service B?	Services do not necessarily to get dynamically linked but could also be statically (i.e. hard-wired) in the invoke service. The way the parameters (and wich parameters) get defined does strongly depend on the definition of the parameters od the linked SDS. Since a precise definition of SDS interfaces is not yet available this cannot yet be answered. No changes in the paper yet, but more details on the parameters and more figures planned, once there is a detailed definition of the SDS interface(s).
SV7	chap 2.5		E	In the Road map on the last page there are two dates for the first draft of the Technical Guidance, will there be a second draft in June 2012?	This was an error. There should be only one draft of the technical guidance. Table has been corrected

[1] Use "3.1" instead of "Clause 3.1" or "Chapter 6.1". This makes grouping of comments easier.

[2] E.g., Table 1

[3] Type of comment can be G (general), E (editorial), T (technical)

[4] The proposed change must be as precise and specific as possible.